



**FINAL**

**THE CITY OF MIRAMAR  
BUSINESS, INCLUSION & DIVERSITY  
CONSTRUCTION & PROFESSIONAL SERVICES  
ADVISORY BOARD MEETING MINUTES**

**AUGUST 13, 2024**

**1:00 P.M.**

A meeting of the City of Miramar’s Economic Development & Housing (EDH) Department’s Business, Inclusion & Diversity (BID) Construction & Professional Services Advisory Board took place at 1:10 p.m. on Tuesday, August 13, 2024, 2<sup>nd</sup> floor, Engineering Conference Room W-201L, EDH Department, 2200 Civic Center Place, Miramar, FL 33023.

**1 & 2 CALL TO ORDER/ATTENDANCE**

The following board members were present:

Vice Chairperson Vernon Williams, Brigcon Construction Svs. (Remote)  
Mac Alabre, CEO, Lien Library Inc.; FIU  
Denise Brown, President, DPX Construction Management  
Priscilla Diaz  
Robert Washington, Jr., Instructor, Carpenters & Pile Drivers Union

The following board member was absent:

Chairperson Dorothy Brown-Alfaro, Owner, Jador Intl. Corp. (Excused)  
Vernon Dooling, Membership Coordinator, Minority Builders Coalition  
Amaury Genao, Turner Construction Company (Excused)  
Garrie Harris, CEO, Alpha 1 Staffing

A quorum was achieved.

Other persons present:

Jordan Gary, City Attorney  
Dr. Karen Hollis, BID  
Karen Mitchell, BID Coordinator  
Paul Njoroge, Business Analyst Manager

### 3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

- **Meeting Minutes of October 31, 2023; January 9, 2024; February 13, 2024; March 12, 2024; April 9, 2024; May 14, 2024**

Dr. Hollis referred to the corrected minutes provided to the board, the majority of which had a significant number of comments from Ms. Brown-Alfaro. She asked board members to defer their vote on the minutes to the next meeting to allow Ms. Brown-Alfaro to be present for the approval of the minutes. In the interim, she would email the board the June meeting.

- There was a board consensus to defer the approval of the minutes to the next meeting.

Ms. Brown felt the repeated deferral of the approval of board minutes impacted the board's ability to move forward. She wondered how long this practice would continue, commenting that the board needed to operate better than this; if the situation persisted, the board would be stuck in a state of flux.

Dr. Hollis explained immediately after each meeting she uploads the audio of meeting onto the City's portal, where the City Clerk retrieved the files, and send them to be transcribed. She recently received the June minutes, but not the July minutes. The backlog could be due to the number of city boards with minutes to be transcribed, as each of the 20 City departments have more than one board.

Ms. Brown clarified she was not speaking about the transcription of the minutes, rather she was referring to the minutes the board already received whose approval kept being deferred. Thus, the problem was with the board not approving its minutes already received, which should not be the case; board members needed to do whatever was necessary prior to each meeting to prepare themselves to approve the minutes at each meeting.

Vice Chairperson Williams concurred, asking if it were possible for the board to meet a second time in the month to deal with the approval of the minutes, agreeing that the failure to approve the board's minutes persisted for a long time. He realized Ms. Brown-Alfaro was very involved, etc., but the board needed to deal with this situation.

City Attorney Gary indicated the board could meet more than once in a month to deal with any matter, as long as the meeting was properly noticed. She explained the board did not have to wait for Ms. Brown-Alfaro's presence to approve the minutes; if the board wished to wait because of Ms. Brown-Alfaro's comments, they were free to do so, but as the board had a quorum, they were at liberty to vote on the minutes at the present meeting if they chose. Logistically, it

made little sense to schedule another meeting in the interim before the next meeting specifically to approve minutes; the board could just put them on the next meeting agenda for approval.

Dr. Hollis pointed out that at the next board meeting she would have the July minutes ready for the board's approval.

City Attorney Gary clarified she was not making a recommendation to the board, simply stating the board's options. If the board chose to schedule a second meeting to approve its minutes, the meeting would have to be properly noticed, recorded, and minutes taken.

Mr. Alabre questioned if there was anything in the minutes ready for the board's approval to which Ms. Brown-Alfaro had to respond before their approval.

Dr. Hollis remarked about 80 percent of the revisions to the minutes came from Ms. Brown-Alfaro, so she preferred that the board to wait to approve the minutes, rather than having to later amend the approved minutes.

Mr. Alabre suggested deferring the approval, as approving them at the present meeting meant Ms. Brown-Alfaro would be held responsible for her changes without the chance to respond prior to approval. Henceforth, however, the board should be conscious of repeatedly postponing the approval of future minutes.

Ms. Brown said she would wait to approve them at the board's next meeting.

Mr. Alabre concurred, adding that repeatedly postponing the meeting did not show the board as being very professional.

City Attorney Gary noted other city advisory boards experienced challenges with the approval of their minutes, mostly due to the failure to achieve a quorum.

Dr. Hollis indicated she would inform Ms. Brown-Alfaro via email that if she was unable to attend the next board meeting, the board intended to proceed with approving the minutes. This would allow her time to send in any comments.

Mr. Alabre made a motion to table the approval of prior meeting minutes as noted in the agenda to the next board meeting; the motion was seconded by Vice Chairperson Williams. The motion passed unanimously.

Dr. Hollis added she would email the board any additional minutes for their review prior to the next meeting.

#### **4. GOVERNMENT UPDATES: West Palm Beach (WPB) Securing a New**

## **Disparity Study**

- a. Contractor News: WPB Examines M/WBE Participation
- b. Newsletter: Data to Support a Disparity Study

Dr. Hollis read in a WPB quarterly newsletter that the City of WPB approved conducting another disparity study; she provided copies of the article to board members. She wished the board to remain abreast of what was taking place in the South Florida's tri-county area, as it differed from that taking place throughout the nation; having the information would allow board members to formulate any questions for Ms. Holt at the next meeting. She noted the WPB article, "Let's Talk Procurement" mentioned the City of WPB approved another disparity study, urging the board to review the article. Dr. Hollis mentioned in Contractor News WPB elected officials sought to maintain contact with minority, and women-owned firms. She provided these articles to Ms. Holt.

## **5. REVIEW OF THE MOST CURRENT LEGISLATION: Attorney Colette Holt**

Dr. Hollis indicated she submitted a purchase order for Ms. Holt to give the board a 30-minute presentation, but Ms. Holt informed her that 30 minutes was insufficient for her to review the current legislation noted below. So she submitted another purchase order on August 13, 2024, requesting an additional 30 minutes, which was now moving through the approval process. Ms. Holt, when contacted, agreed to attend the September 10, 2024, board meeting, at which she would speak from 1:30 p.m. to 2:30 p.m.

- a. House Bill (HB) 705 & HB 742
- b. Impact on City's Disparity Study Findings
- c. Impact on City's BID Program

Vice Chairperson Williams asked if anyone heard if HB 705 was approved. Mr. Alabre believed it was approved, and it took effect on July 1, 2024.

Vice Chairperson Williams wished to know the amount of impact this would have on the City's BID Program.

Dr. Hollis responded that this was part of the reason Ms. Holt was invited to speak to the board. She will provide the board with a summary of legislative information, including HB 705 and HB 742; discuss industry response to the legislation, identifying specific cities, and the steps they were taking, along with the recommendations she provided to cities she worked with. Attorney Holt would provide her opinion on how the City of Miramar would be affected, and any steps the City should consider taking.

d. Any Adjustments Needed on BID Manual

Vice Chairperson Willaims sought confirmation the City's BID Manual was currently on hold to await discussions on the recently passed legislation.

Dr. Hollis reminded that Attorney Holt was hired to assist with developing the City's BID Manual, and she provided her revised version to the City in December 2023. In light of the new legislation, it made sense to have Attorney Holt weigh in on if it effects the BID Manual, which already included board recommendations.

**6. NEW BUSINES**

a. Follow-up on BID Training Sessions (Survey Results)

Dr. Hollis stated she conducted city department training sessions as scheduled. It was a successful effort, as all scheduled department staff attended; she gave them a complete overview of the City's BID Program, providing them with a layout of the over 30 initiatives implemented to date. Departments were asked to appoint a liaison to work with BID Program staff to facilitate the collection of data. She noted all the departments were informed that effective October 1, 2024, the City's BID Program would be collecting data on departmental spending outside of the Procurement Department. These included spending valued at up to \$5,000.00 that was not secured or paid via the usual procurement process.

Vice Chairperson Williams asked if departments were collecting data on local firms bidding on small city contracts.

Dr. Hollis answered no, but the City is seeking measures to be able to do so in the future. Procurement will be releasing a solicitation by the end of the current month to secure another management program. Dr. Hollis stated the new measures being considered is expected to enable the City to collect definitive data, such as the number of businesses owned by women, minorities, etc. that was not possible with the existing system. She consulted with cities using the same system the City used to see if they used system to secure minority goals and each said they did not. Miramar's reason for ending its agreement with the current system provider was due to city staff's being unable to effectively utilize the system for the purposes for which it was intended; that is, to help add more goals to the City's business contracts. The City successfully used the system for marketing and outreach. The 21<sup>st</sup> Century approach is to utilize technology to apply metrics, research firms, establish minority participation goals, and compliance/monitoring data collection. A consultant's pilot program evidenced the ability of the City to get a wider geographic reach in South Florida, and help the City conduct more thorough research in seeking to apply participation goals.

Vice Chairperson Williams sought confirmation on the extent of the reach the new vendor would provide.

Dr. Hollis stated the target areas were Munroe, Dade, Broward, and Palm Beach Counties, and the desire to partner with a consultant capable of accessing a larger number of firms in the geographical area. Miramar's goal is to focus more on local, small, minority businesses.

A member asked if the disparity study covered all scopes of work; that is, from infrastructure to government, such as hospitals, airports, etc. He wished to know if infrastructure jobs that were a part of city government's development projects were included, or were they held separate from the study.

Dr. Hollis explained the disparity study covered a wide variety of fields and industry-related trades. City project scopes are reviewed on a contract-by-contract basis to determine the industry trade areas to be included in any search.

Vice Chairperson Williams questioned if the new house bills would affect projects funded with federal dollars.

Dr. Hollis stated this was a question Ms. Holt could answer. At present, the City placed no participation goals on federally funded projects.

Vice Chairperson Williams wondered if this, too, applied to Broward County funded projects.

Dr. Hollis remarked Broward County (Surtax/Map) projects are reviewed and funded by the County. The County applies and notifies of the minority percentage goals, which cities must include when the project solicitation is released. Projects include roadway improvements, bike lane extensions, and other transportation improvements funded with surtax dollars.

b. M/WBE Outreach Events or Opportunities

Dr. Hollis referred the board to the information provided in their packet; the City would host the subject outreach event on Thursday, August 29, 2024 to inform local businesses of City opportunities made available to them through the EDH Department. Several departments will present and a tour of co-working building. She asked the BID Advisory Board members to register, attend the event, and tour the BIND Space Building.

**7. ANNOUNCEMENTS & INFORMATION**

a. Turner Construction "Meet the Primes": August 26, 2024

Dr. Hollis mentioned that board member Amaury Genao of Turner Construction, who was currently touring, asked her to schedule the subject event for August 26, and she was awaiting confirmation. If confirmed she would communicate to board members.

- b. KEH to Attend SBDC Conference: August 19-22, 2024 (St. Petersburg)

Dr. Hollis explained she will attend the Small Business Development Conference (SBDC) conference to connect with small businesses.

Dr. Hollis asked board members to list items they wished included for discussion at future meetings. She sought clarification on Mr. Washington's question on updated construction contracts for Miramar bids.

Vice Chairperson Williams wished to know if Miramar's database was current with regard to contractors' level of success when bidding on city contracts.

Dr. Hollis indicated city staff has not tracked this data. In the past, she had reported results of contracts to the board.

Mr. Washington had asked Dr. Hollis to collect letters from firms of their support of BID. She receives appreciation comments from various firms during and after BID events. She also sent emails to a few local small businesses, asking them respond and received one response, and two others indicating they would submit a letter accordingly. She would create more substantial way to document firm's appreciation of BID events, and relay responses to the board. Another board suggestion was tracking the success of other BID board's outreach programs. Noted.

Vice Chairperson Williams wanted to know how the City's outreach programs were structured, and what could be done to improve them.

Dr. Hollis said she desired more BID board support at BID event; and stated that she would email them the flyers for various events for them send out to their business database. This could increase event attendance. She provided the Board with the floorplans for the Consultants Fair, on Wednesday, October 30, 2024; which contained a list of City vendors and other entities the City partnered with, including the Urban League, Miami-Dade County, Broward College, Broward Health, etc.

Vice Chairperson Williams inquired at to the status of the recent city landscape contract that included contracting with local small businesses for portions of the scope of work.

Dr. Hollis informed that a landscape contract was recently approved which the director reported included local small firms. He stated that many city parks were too large to be effectively and timely managed by small businesses. In the past when the City awarded landscaping to small contractors, they experienced difficulty and could not perform. The City gave grants to help small businesses purchase equipment and material to perform the work. But, small businesses struggled during the pandemic and the lack of people available to work.

Vice Chairperson Williams questioned how the City could develop a program to help small businesses secure licenses that helped them compete for bids; having the proper equipment was one challenge, but they needed to be properly licensed, and insured to compete for such contracts.

Dr. Hollis suggested having Parks & Recreation Director Billy Neal speak to the board on the matter at the next meeting.

Vice Chairperson Williams responded that firms need guidance on how to secure the proper licenses.

Dr. Hollis sought clarification on Mr. Washington's request for in-person meetings with all members of the City Commission, asking if the request was for them to attend a BID Advisory Board meeting.

Mr. Washington wished to know if the City of Miramar had districts; if so, did each commissioner issue work reports on whether the businesses in their district were operating successfully; he mentioned the information in the City's BID database for businesses in each district.

Dr. Hollis explained the BID database was not according to any district. The database was maintained by EDH Department staff, and the Business Inclusion Program allowed businesses to enter their information into that database. Prime contractors accessed information on available firms. This process has nothing to do with the City's elected officials.

City Attorney Gary indicated the City did not have districts, and each member of the City Commission was responsible for all areas of Miramar.

Dr. Hollis remarked that most members of the City Commission held an annual small business event; such events were not limited to any particular industry, or area of Miramar, and there events were open to all businesses.

City Attorney Gary added that if any board member wished elected officials to attend a board meeting, only one elected official could attend at a time to prevent any violation of the Sunshine Law.

Mr. Washington clarified he was not requesting any elected official attend a board meeting.

Mr. Alabre suggested Mr. Washington do a search by zip code in the City's business database to determine where businesses were located, and from there explore levels of success, etc.

**8. ADJOURNMENT:**

Next meeting: Tuesday, September 10, 2024, @ 1:00 p.m.

The meeting was adjourned at 2:26 p.m.

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Dorothy Brown-Alfaro, Chairperson  
DB/cp

